Doc 23 Filed 11/14/10 Document

Entered 11/14/10 14:49:42 Page 1 of 9

P.1 Desc Main

UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT **DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS**

BROWN,	CYNTHIA	

Case No. 10-19354-FJB

Debtor

MOTION OF DEBTOR TO DETERMINE THAT CHAPTER 13 STATEMENT OF CURRENT MONTHLY AND DISPOSABLE INCOME (FORM B22C) DOES NOT DETERMINE PLAN PAYMENT

Now comes the Debtor, Cynthia Ann Brown, and does hereby move this Honorable Court for an Order that her filed Chapter 13 Statement of Current Monthly and Disposable Income (Form B22C) does not Determine Plan Payment. In Support of this motion, Debtor states as follows:

- 1. Debtor filed for Chapter 13 Relief on August 30, 2010.
- 2. Debtor appeared with counsel at her duly scheduled 341 meeting on October 15, 2010.
- 3. At the 341 meeting, Debtor was examined under oath regarding her petition and schedules appurtenant thereto.
- 4. The Debtor's schedule I indicates that she has actual average monthly household income of \$13,264.39, (with the vast amount of this income coming from her non-filing spouse).
- 5. The Debtor's schedule J indicates average actual monthly household expenses of \$12,703.76.
- 6. The actual Statement of Monthly Net Income (from paragraph 20 of Schedule J) is \$560.63 a month.
- 7. The above income and expense figures were used to complete the Chapter 13 Statement of Current monthly and Disposable Income (form B22C) and resulted in a proposed Plan payment of \$2093.02.

P.2

- 8. The Debtor's proposed Plan proposes to pay the actual net disposable \$560.63 in a monthly Plan payment for a period of 60 months.
- 9. On or about November 2, 2010, the Chapter 13 Trustee filed an objection to the Debtor's Plan because it did not propose to pay the amount determined by the B22C. Debtor has filed a response.
- 10. The Chapter 13 Trustee does not object to the actual income and expense figures on schedule I and J.
- 11. Future projected amounts the Debtor reasonably expends monthly for Recreation; Car Insurance; Holiday Gifts; Car Repairs; Home Maintenance; Misc. Household Expenses; and Cable bill total over \$1,557 per month and are not either listed in the plain language of B22C or limited to some degree.
- 12. Debtor's actual future expenses are known and virtually certain to occur. Whereas, the B22C allows only certain expense deductions under a mechanical approach which is not related to the specific Debtor's actual projected future expenses.
- 13. It is evident that the Debtor has more in real monthly household expense than is apparently listed under the standard mechanical approach of the B22C form, and that Debtor has proposed to pay all that she can actual afford to pay.
- 14. The United States Supreme Court under Hamilton, Chapter 13 Trustee v. Lanning, No. 08-998, (decided June 7, 2010) has recently rejected the mechanical approach to viewing the Debtor's projected future disposable income.

WHEREFORE, the Debtor respectfully requests this Court for an Order allowing her Motion to determine that the Chapter 13 Statement of Current Monthly and Disposable Income (Form B22C) Does Not Determine Plan Payment.

TO:918772297079

P.3

Entered 11/14/10 14:49:42 Desc Main Filed 11/14/10 Case 10-19354 Doc 23 Document Page 3 of 9

Respectfully Submitted,

By: /s/ Terrence L. Parker, Esq. 8.B.O.#555277 Parker Law Offices 185 Alewife Brook Parkway Suite 404 Cambridge, MA 02138 TParker612@aol.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The above signed hereby certifies that a copy of the within Motion to Determine was served upon the Debtor at her address of record and upon the Chapter 13 Trustee, John Fitzgerald, US Trustee, electronically via the CM/ECF system and to the attached service list.

NOV-12-2010 01:00P FROM:

TO:918772297079

P.4 Case 10-19354 Doc 23 Filed 11/14/10 Entered 11/14/10 14:49:42 Desc Main

Document Page 4 of 9

Case Number: 10-19354 1 of 6 **BROWN SERVICE LIST**

Recovery Management Systems Corporation 25 S.E. 2nd Avenue, Suite 1120 Miami, FL 33131

AT&T Universal Card PO Box 6239 Sioux Falls, SD 57117

Apex Financial Management 1120 W Lake Cook Road Buffalo Grove, IL 60089

BAC Home Loan Servicing 450 American Street Simi Valley, CA 93065

BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP PO Box 15222 Wilmington, DE 19886-5222

Chase Bank PO Box 15298 Wilmington, DE 19850

Chase Bank PO Box 78509 Phoenix, AZ 85062

Chase/BankOne P.O. Box 15145 Wilimington, DE 19580

2 of 6

Citi Auto 2208 Hwy 121 Bedford, TX 76021

CitiFinancial Auto
Bankruptcy Department
P.O. Box 1472
Minneapolis, MN 55440-1472

CitiFinancial Auto PO Box 9585 Coppell, TX 75019

Citibank PO Box 6241 Sioux Falls, SD 57117

City Of Brockton Office Of The Collector Of Taxes 45 School Street Brockton, MA 02301

Debora Debonis Massachusetts Department Of Revenue 200 Arlington Street, Rm 4300 Chelsea, MA 02150

Department Stores National Bank/Macys Bankruptcy Processing PO Box 8053 Mason, OH 45040

Discover Bank
Dfs Services LLC
PO Box 3025

P.6

Case 10-19354 Doc 23

Filed 11/14/10 Document

Entered 11/14/10 14:49:42 Desc Main Page 6 of 9

New Albany, OH 43054-3025 Discover Financial Service PO Box 15316 Wilmington, DE 19850

3 of 6

Discover Financial Services, LLC Attn: Bankruptcy Department PO Box 3025 New Albany, OH 43054

HSBC

Attn: Bankruptcy Department

P.O. Box 5213

Carol Stream, IL 60197

HSBC PO Box 961245

Fort Worth, TX 76161

Hilco Receivables Attn: Bankruptcy 1120 Lake Cook Road, Suite B Buffalo Grove, IL 60089

Internal Revenue Service 120 Liberty Street Brockton, MA 02301

Internal Revenue Service P.O. Box 21126 Philadelphia, PA 19114

Macy's 9111 Duke Blvd Mason, OH 45040 Doc 23 Filed 11/14/10 Document

Entered 11/14/10 14:49:42 Desc Main Page 7 of 9

4 of 6

P.7

Macy's / FDSB

Attn: Macy's Bankruptcy

PO Box 8053

Mason, OH 45040

Macy's / FDSB Macy's Bankruptcy PO Box 8053 Mason, OH 45040

Massachusetts Department Of Revenue **Bankruptcy Unit** P.O. Box 9564 Boston, MA 02114-9564

National Capital Management, LLC. 8245 Tournament Drive Suite 230 Memphis, TN 38125

USA

Recovery Management Systems Corporation 25 S.E. 2nd Avenue, Suite 1120 Miami, FL 33131-1605

Sears / CBSD 701 East 60th Street N Sioux Falls, SD 57117

Sears / CBSD PO Box 6189 Sioux Falls, SD 57117 Case 10-19354 Doc 23 Filed 11/14/10 Entered 11/14/10 14:49:42 Desc Main Document Page 8 of 9

5 of 6

Sears / CBSD
Sears Bankruptcy Recovery
PO Box 20363
Kansas City, MO 64195

Silverleaf Resorts, Inc. 1221 Riverbend Drive Suite 120 Dallas, TX 75247

Textron Financial Corporation 40 Westminster Street Providence, RI 02903

Universal / Citibank Attn: Centralized Bankruptcy PO Box 20507 Kansas City, MO 64195

Universal / Citibank PO Box 6241 Sioux Falls, SD 57117

WF Fin Bank
Wells Fargo Financial
4137 121st Street
Urbendale, IA 50323

Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. 4137 121st Street Urbandale, IA 50323

Wells Fargo Cards 3201 N. 4th Avenue Sioux Falls, SD 57104

TO:918772297079

P.9 Case 10-19354 Doc 23 Filed 11/14/10 Entered 11/14/10 14:49:42 Desc Main

Document Page 9 of 9

6 of 6

eCAST Settlement Corporation, assignee of Chase Bank USA, N.A. POB 29262

New York, NY 10087-9262 eCAST Settlement Corporation, assignee of Citibank (South Dakota), N.A. POB 29262 New York, NY 10087-9262

Cynthia Ann Brown 26 Highland Terrace Brockton, MA 02301